

# Temperance and the Scottish Churches, 1870-1914

N. D. DENNY, M.A., Dip.Ed., Ph.D.

By 1870, the "drink question" had been debated in Scottish society by various groups, drink trade, temperance, clerical and more especially lay, for nearly 40 years. The temperance movement had attained an accepted rôle in the ranks of social reform, as highlighted by Shaftesbury's assertion that "without these societies we should be involved in such an ocean of intoxication, violence and sin as would make this country quite uninhabitable". The ideological basis of "temperance" in its successive phases of "moderation", known as the anti-spirits movement, total abstinence, and prohibition had long since been devised, developed and popularised. The points of policy at dispute between total abstainers and prohibitionists were deeply etched in the minds of all manner of temperance reformers, although distinctions between shades of temperance sentiment were far more roughly drawn in the popular mind.<sup>1</sup>

Such was hardly the case at the beginning of the century. Although from the early eighteenth century, cheap, easily obtainable whisky had already replaced French wines and home brewed beers as the Scottish national drink, with quite disastrous social results, "temperance sentiment" was expressed only infrequently by eccentric individuals. Gentlemen like Boswell made

<sup>1</sup> C. Drummond, *An Outline of the Temperance Question* (London, 1906), 28. Nineteenth-century sources for the movement include E. Morris, *A History of Teetotalism* (Glasgow, 1853); S. Couling, *A History of the Temperance Movement* (London, 1862); W. Logan, *The Early Heroes of the Temperance and Teetotal Societies in Glasgow from their Origin* (Glasgow, 1873); P. Winskill, *A Comprehensive History of the Rise and Progress of the Temperance Movement to 1881* (Warrington, 1881); J. D. Burns, *Temperance History*, 2 vols. (London, 1881); J. Burns, *A Temperance History* (London, 1889); P. Winskill, *The Temperance Movement and its Workers* (London, 1893); A. Aird, "The Temperance Movement", in *Glimpses of Old Glasgow* (Glasgow, 1894); and R. Reid, "The Early History of the Temperance Movement in Scotland", in *Scottish Temperance League Register and Abstainers' Almanac* [hereafter STLR] (1897), 62-66. On the twentieth-century movement see T. Hamilton, *The Temperance Reformation in Scotland with special reference to John Dunlop and Greenock 1829-1929* (Greenock, 1929). Major secondary sources include D. Paton, "Drink and the Temperance Movement in Nineteenth-Century Scotland", (Edinburgh Ph.D. thesis, 1977); B. Harrison, *Drink and the Victorians: the Temperance Question in England 1815-1872* (London, 1971); A. Dingle, *The Campaign for Prohibition in Victorian England: the U.K.A. 1872-1895* (London, 1980); W. Lambert, "Drink and Sobriety in Wales 1835-1895", (Swansea Ph.D. thesis, 1969); and N. Logan, "Drink and Society: Scotland 1870-1914", (Glasgow Ph.D. thesis, 1984), of which the material which follows first formed chap. 8.

resolutions to abstain but none was surprised let alone outraged when they failed to do so. If Cockburn is to be believed, gentry supper parties were notoriously drunken. Temperance sentiment, in the sense of horror at the prevalence of drink abuse, and misuse of the nation's grain resources by the drink trade, came only with the trade dislocations and distress of the Napoleonic War years. The theme of misuse of resources, foreshadowing Chartist criticism of national expenditure, Anti-Corn Law League rhetoric, and later "national efficiency" arguments, was to be frequently traced in penny tracts. Underlying such criticism was popular drinking usages' threat to social order. This was evident in preoccupation with the rise of illicit distilling in the years after the excise reform of 1822. Indeed, this was one of the deep-rooted nerves of the middle-class conscience, harshly jarred by the "drink question" from the 1840s onwards.<sup>2</sup>

Opportunities for Scots to indulge in heavy drinking pre-dated the temperance movement. Several parts of Scotland were over-licensed. In 1832, Glasgow provided business for 1,360 spirit dealers, a ratio of one to every 14 families. The ratios for smaller towns and rural areas were not markedly better. The alarming factor injected into this situation after the 1840s was the way an aristocratic tradition of heavy drinking was increasingly being adopted and upheld by the urban lower classes. The so called "drink question" was thus essentially a side-effect of industrialisation and the changes it wrought on social customs, especially where the drinking habits of Celts and rural Scots were moulded to fit participation in an industrial workforce, and an often uncertain urban future. Although temperance was strong in the east and in the Borders, home of the Sunday Closing legislator, Forbes Mackenzie, by the late 1850s it tended to be concentrated in west-central Scotland a commentary upon "the age of cotton", and later upon the development of a heavy producer-goods

<sup>2</sup> On Boswell, I. Lustig and F. Pottle, *Boswell: the Applause of the Jury 1782-1785* (London, 1982). In the 1820s, an article did appear in *Edinburgh Encyclopedia* on use of wines and spirits but had more influence abroad than in Scotland. Cockburn anecdotes abound in E. King, *Scotland Sober and Free: The Temperance Movement 1829-1979* (Glasgow, 1979) 4-5; D. Daiches, *Glasgow* (London, 1977), 66-67; C. Oakley, *The Second City* (Glasgow, 1946), 22. Prohibition of distilling during the Napoleonic Wars is mentioned in the Select Committee on Drunkenness, Report of Minutes of Evidence, *P.P.*, 1834, (559) viii, 914, 106. Glasgow Chamber of Commerce support for this is mentioned in Oakley, *Our Illustrious Forebears* (Glasgow, 1980), 27, 38. On excise reform acceleration of "shebeening", see D. Paton, "Drink and the Temperance Movement", 5-20; I. Donnachie "Drink and Sobriety 1750-1850: Some aspects of the Scottish Experience", *Scottish Labour History Society Journal* 13 (1979), 9-11. Engels' comments on increased drinking in this era appear in *The Condition of the Working Classes in England*, edd. W. Henderson and W. Chaloner (Oxford, 1958), 148, and are an interesting contrast to the Dunlop interpretation.

industrial economy. The city of Glasgow's importance to the movement was reflected in the Temperance Congress of 1862, the first of several national congresses to be held there.<sup>3</sup>

Temperance reformers like John Dunlop of Greenock (1789-1868) felt that the occasions on which it was socially acceptable, if not "de riguer", to become drunk escalated with each generation. Comparison with the experiences of other nations, including Catholic Europe, was odious. This shocked many who assumed the moral superiority of countries which had responded positively to Calvinism. This explains later use by temperance reformers of the phrase "temperance reformation" to describe their aims, plus references to Greenock as "the Geneva of Temperance". Elsewhere the connection between consumption, hospitality or conviviality, and business transactions seemed occasional. In Scotland it was "universal", a fad which threatened to become permanent. Growing concern for the quality of Scottish life focussed increasingly on high rates of poverty, crime, immorality, ignorance, and above all the drunkenness which seemed to underpin these, as emblems of a national lack of moral and spiritual purpose. Promotion of temperance societies symbolised desire to strike at the root of all manner of social evils, thereby reintroducing the masses to Christian observance through personal and national reformation. Nationalism was quite definitely a sentiment tapped and channelled by the temperance movement.<sup>4</sup>

Temperance societies, modelled on American self-help associations, sprang up in Scotland in the 1820s and 1830s. Their ideology and personnel overlapped with moral force Chartism and radicalism. They represented an allowance of the middle and working classes for reform. All at this stage were "anti-spirits" or "moderation" societies, open to abstainers and non-abstainers

<sup>3</sup> Select Committee on Drunkenness, Minutes of Evidence, P.P. 1834 (above), 175. S. Mechie, *The Church and Scottish Social Development 1780-1870* (London, 1960), 80; I. Donnachie, "Drink and Society", 5-22, and also his *History of the Brewing Industry in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1979), 129; Pace W. L. Burn, *The Age of Equipoise* (London, 1964), 281, historians regard the 1830 Beer Act as "revolutionary in its social consequences". The following have been found useful as studies of industrial development: S. Checkland, *The Upas Tree — Glasgow 1875-1975* (Glasgow, 1981), chaps. 1 and 2; A. Gibb, *Glasgow — The Making of a City* (London, 1983), 115-146; A. Slaven, *The Development of the West of Scotland 1750-1960* (London, 1975), chaps. 5-7.

<sup>4</sup> S. Mechie, *Church and Scottish Social Development*, 81-99; the *Autobiography of John Dunlop* (p.p., 1832). Dunlop claimed widespread emphasis of "conviviality" had ironically increased the self-indulgence of the solitary drinker: see J. Dunlop, *The Philosophy of Artificial and Compulsory Drinking Usages in Great Britain* (London, 1839), 76, 289. The Select Committee on Drunkenness, Minutes of Evidence, cited above, noted the ubiquity of drinking, the social categories of drinkers, Swedish and French examples, and Spanish and Italian superiority in "general education" via greater sobriety, at 178, 516, 183, 222, and 500 respectively.

alike.<sup>5</sup> The movement's "total abstinence" phase began with the Scottish Temperance League formed at Falkirk in 1844. Its members pledged to abstain from all intoxicating beverages. Moderationist societies continued however, such as the Scottish Association for the Suppression of Drunkenness (1850) and the Glasgow Abstainers Union (1854). The prohibitionist dimension was added immediately after passage of the American Maine Law, and was greatly encouraged by formation of two national prohibition societies in the late 1850s, the Scottish Prohibition Society and the Scottish Permissive Bill and Temperance Society, and introduction of quasi-masonic Good Templary in 1869. A Scottish Prohibition Party followed in 1901.<sup>6</sup>

By 1870 temperance societies for men, women, and children existed all over Scotland from the Borders to the Northern Isles, aided by an opening up of the political system after the Reform Act to pressure-group politics. Juvenile societies were among the earliest Scottish temperance societies, and the Scottish Band of Hope Union (1870) worked closely with the Churches. As yet, however, denominational temperance societies were few in number and limited in scope.<sup>7</sup>

Late nineteenth-century temperance reformers rode waves of temperance fervour, with peaks and troughs in society, numerical and financial strength dictated by competition of charitable organisations for support, revivals, society initiatives, and

<sup>5</sup> STLR (1899), 61-63, "Temperance Events in Scotland During the Reign of Victoria"; L. Wright, *Scottish Chartism* (Edinburgh, 1953), 36-39 describes Fraser of Johnston's teetotal Chartism, the *Edinburgh Monthly Democrat and Total Abstainers' Advocate*, the Universal Suffrage Association's "fundamental belief in temperance", and p. 87 *Chartist Circular* advocacy of the temperance pledge for all Chartists. On temperance and the Chartist Churches, see Wright, *Scottish Chartism*, 96-125; H. Faulkner, *Chartism and the Churches* (London, 1970), 107-09; A. Wilson, *The Chartist Movement in Scotland* (Manchester, 1970), 126-38; S. Mechie, *Church and Scottish Social Development*, 100-18; B. Harrison, "Teetotal Chartism", *History*, 58 (1973); B. Harrison and P. Hollis, "Chartism, Liberalism, and the Life of Robert Lowery", *English Historical Review* (July, 1967), 503-35.

<sup>6</sup> For the Maine Law (1851) which prohibited all manufacture and retail of "spirituous liquors" state-wide, see N. Dow, *The Reminiscences of Neal Dow Recollections of 80 Years* (Portland, 1898); H. S. Clubb, *The Maine Law* (New York, 1856); J. D. Burns, *Temperance History* (London, 1881), i, 409, 419, 431, 444. On the Scottish Prohibition Society, see A. Aird, "Temperance Movement", 217. There are several commissioned histories of the Good Templars, notably T. Honeyman, *Good Templary in Scotland: its Work and Workers* (Glasgow, 1894), and by the same author, *Good Templary: A Jubilee Volume* (Glasgow, 1924). Prohibitionism is discussed in N. Logan, "Drink and Society", 271-341.

<sup>7</sup> On work in the Northern Isles, see W. Logan, *Sketch of the Life and Labours of R. G. Mason* (Glasgow, 1864), and on the Band of Hope, *The Band of Hope Jubilee Volume*, ed. F. Smith (London, 1897). In the years before the Scottish Temperance League faced competition from other national societies its strength was concentrated in Glasgow (1,100 subscribers) Edinburgh (330) and Hawick (104) according to STLR (1859).

economic circumstances.<sup>8</sup> They rallied the faithful by gauging support in terms of two respected professions, the medical profession and the clergy. This was very true of the period between the 1880s and formation of the Scottish Temperance Alliance (1924), an amalgamation of the major societies to orchestrate the Local Veto Polls of the 1920s. Ironically, at the movement's centenary celebrations in 1932, reformers looked to many temperance victories, but all had passed and temperance as a mass movement was dead.<sup>9</sup>

A medical volte face towards support for temperance was virtually complete by 1908. No less fascinating in complexity, however, is acceptance of teetotalism by the Churches in this period.<sup>10</sup> In spite of the tendency to associate temperance with the moral crusades of the "Nonconformist Conscience", or the enthusiastic reclamation work of the Salvation Army, the notion of an inevitable tie-up between these Churches and the movement is deceptive. While close connections between temperance and Dissent may have reinforced the "explosive militancy" of some English Churches, in Scotland Presbyterian schisms of more recent origins, plus common theology, traditions, forms of government, not to mention the power of Scottish Dissent in urban areas especially, meant that in general the Scottish Churches tended to adopt positive attitudes to reform, but out-and-out militancy by any one Church was preempted. Recently, even the assumption of English Nonconformist interest in radical temperance solutions has been qualified. Bebbington found this was not widespread until a relatively late date. "At the peak of the Nonconformist Conscience temperance still seemed a growing concern, a cause of the

<sup>8</sup> Scottish Temperance Alliance, *The S.T.A. — What it is and What it Does* (Glasgow, 1924); the Centenary Committee, *Centenary of the Scottish Temperance Movement in Scotland 1832-1932* (Glasgow, 1932).

<sup>9</sup> C. Drummond, *An Outline of the Temperance Question* (Glasgow, 1906), 29; *No Licence: the New Campaign* (Glasgow, 1921), 92-105; "Legislative Report: A Sketch of the Development of the Scottish Liquor Licensing Laws"; T. Hamilton, *The Temperance Reformation in Scotland with special reference to John Dunlop and Greenock 1829-1929* (Greenock, 1929).

<sup>10</sup> STLR (1908), "The Medical Manifesto", 112-115; G. Wilson, *Alcohol and the Nation* (London, 1940); "The Change in Medical Opinion and Practice", 261. Temperance and the Churches has been touched upon by a variety of historians, e.g. M. McGregor, *Towards Scotland's Social Good* (Edinburgh, 1959); S. Mechie, *The Church and Scottish Social Development*, 81-99; K. Heasman, *Evangelicals in Action: An Appraisal of Social Work in the Victorian Era* (London, 1962), 126-47; B. Harrison, "Religion and Recreation in Nineteenth-Century England", *Past and Present*, 38 (1967); S. Koss *Nonconformity in Modern British Politics* (London, 1975); C. Binfield, *So Down to Prayers: Studies in English Nonconformity 1780-1920* (London, 1977); D. Paton, "Drink and the Temperance Movement," 326-75; D. Bebbington, *The Nonconformist Conscience: Chapel and Politics 1870-1914* (London, 1982).

future'.<sup>11</sup> Dissenters were really very cautious in support for temperance. Several prominent laymen did not attach themselves to the movement until the Great War "Patriotic Pledge Campaign", a drive common to Britain, France and Russia. A Congregationalist Total Abstinence Society (1874) only swayed Congregationalist conferences after 1885, not all Congregationalists were total abstainers even in 1904, and the Baptist Union Assembly rejected moves in 1897 to have teetotalism made a qualification for office. Above all it seems dangerous to generalise about the Methodist temperance connection. Few Wesleyans were noted temperance reformers in the 1870s, and while Primitive Methodists were teetotal pioneers, Wesleyan conferences of the turn of the century were hostile to further insistence upon teetotalism. A Wesleyan Temperance Committee existed only after 1875, and was organised on a dual basis. In addition, although the Salvation Army engaged in highly commendable work among the Glasgow poor, and habitual drunkards in particular, from 1879 onwards (featuring public house visitations, "Saved Drunkards' Meetings", several institutes, a "Rescue Home", and special "Police and Prison Work"), Salvationists did not actually join in the Scottish temperance movement. This lack of co-operation, which puzzled the man-in-the-street of the time, is all the more difficult to understand given the way in which the Army was originally invited to Scotland by the temperance reformer Thomas Robinson of Hurlet, and received financial support initially from others such as the Clarkes of Paisley, Gallie the Glasgow publisher, and the Macfie family. One might have expected its Glasgow Major, Henry Edmonds, a prohibitionist born in Maine U.S.A., to have been prominent in the movement. He was not, doubtless singleminded in his promotion of the Army. Clearly, patterns of support were not straightforward, even when temperance had become a mass movement. Temperance reformers had to put pressure on their churches in addition to the general population.

Early temperance reformers like John Dunlop, a Church of Scotland elder, and William Collins I (1789-1853), an elder with Chalmers at the Tron Church, Glasgow and St John's, better known for his later church-extension work than for his endorsement of Chalmer's reputed tendency to water down guests' whisky, had first to convince the clergy that temperance did not seek to supplant orthodox Christianity. Clergymen were among the first to criticise Dunlop's attempts to introduce American-style temperance societies. Professor Dick of the Secession Church was exceptional in even permitting the use of church property for temperance lectures. Much early propaganda aimed to persuade churchmen that temperance, although capable of use for secular

<sup>11</sup> D. Paton, "Drink and the Temperance Movement," 326-32; D. Bebbington, *Nonconformist Conscience*, 46-47.

ends, sought to facilitate the work of evangelisation. Temperance was fortunate in having the support of the publishers Collins, J. Blackie & Sons, K. & R. Davidson, Gallie, Chambers, Knight, and Cassell.

Temperance was received most sympathetically, however, by those engaged in overseas missions. It appealed to men like the Revd Joseph Wolff and Revd George Wisely of St Andrew's, Valletta, who wanted to bring an end to the Sabbath Carnivals or "pagan Bacchanalia" of the Mediterranean, to those labouring in hot and already unhealthy climes, like J. G. Paton, to those who feared drink's effects on the native races and supported New Zealand's determined attempts to discourage drinking by blacks, and also those who worked to counter what Temple Gairdner dubbed, "the reproach of Islam" regarding alcohol and religious observances. Given the growth of a noisy B.M.A. teetotal pressure group, few medical missionaries remained immune to temperance. Overseas, temperance could be used to ward off charges of interference in native culture and licentiousness, placing missionaries beyond reproach, or so the Revd S. S. Wilson thought.<sup>12</sup>

At home, the great majority of Presbyterian churchmen suspected temperance of heretical or subversive tendencies, epitomised by the Revd Patrick Brewster (1788-1859) of Paisley Abbey and Teetotal Chartism. Many also disapproved of reformers' willingness to co-operate with Father Mathew, the Irish reformer, on his visit to Scotland in 1841. Others simply resented Dunlop's inference that the clergy were to blame for increases in consumption and drunkenness by their lack of social concern.<sup>13</sup> The Disruption was both a hindrance and a help to temperance. The Voluntary and Non-Intrusion controversies absorbed the interest of individuals and churches for several years. On the other hand, most of the propaganda effective in urging clergymen to attack drinking and drunkenness was penned by a generation of men, like the city missionary William Logan (1813-79), profoundly influenced by the evangelical revival. Only after the Disruption were United Secession and United Presbyterian denominational temperance societies formed, in 1845 and 1847 respectively. The United Presbyterians had no Temperance Committee until 1866, in spite of the way U.P. laymen such as Henderson of Park the

<sup>12</sup> J. Wolff, *Journal of the Revd Joseph Wolff in a Series of Letters to Sir Thomas Baring* (London, 1839), 74-75; S. S. Wilson, *A Narrative of the Greek Mission* (London, 1839), 161-62.

<sup>13</sup> S. Mechie, *The Church and Scottish Social Development*, 85-86; D. Paton, "Drink and the Temperance Movement", 333. Typical of this phase were William Collins, *On the Harmony Between the Gospel and Temperance Societies* (Glasgow, 1836), and M. Willis, *Temperance Societies — Scriptural* (Glasgow, 1831). On the 1841 visit, see J. Maguire, *Father Mathew — A Biography* (Cork, 1864).

Glasgow shipowner, were very prominent in the movement. The Free Church established a Temperance Committee (1847) and a Society (1849). Leading lights of the latter included the Revd William Arnot (1807-1875) of Free St Peter's, Glasgow, a Scottish Temperance League leader and tract writer, and Dr Thomas Guthrie (1803-1873) of St John's, Edinburgh, the well known promoter of ragged schools. Progress within other churches was slow.<sup>14</sup>

In these early denominational societies longstanding clerical criticism of drunken funerals and ordination dinner excesses was an important theme. The evangelical revival had focussed attention not only upon unseemly behaviour and extravagance, but also on the need to revitalise protestant morals. Drunken funerals were regarded as pagan, and too reminiscent of Irish wakes. Evangelical moral enthusiasm encouraged a new concern for order, and new awareness of the interdependence of physical and spiritual needs. The assault on ordination dinners reflected nascent awareness of the clergy's image as a profession. The Church of Scotland, caught up in this ferment, was quick to appoint a Committee of Inquiry and subsequently a permanent Committee on Intemperance in 1848.

These initiatives, and the Free Church decision to petition Parliament on intemperance and measures to check spirit-drinking, were also partly the work of a pressure group of abstaining ministers, The Association For The Promotion of Temperance By Means of the Churches and Involvement in Denominational Temperance Societies. Prominent therein were the Revd T. C. Wilson of Dunkeld, backed in the Church of Scotland courts by the juvenile temperance reformer, Revd John Hope of Edinburgh (1807-93), and Professor Miller of the Free Church Temperance Committee. There were no formal links between Church temperance committees and the great national societies. Nevertheless they were beginning to co-operate.

Ironically, in the middle of the nineteenth century, when the "cult of respectability" was strongest, teetotal activists still faced general clerical apathy to the organisations they had created. This was only partly eroded by tract literature from men like the Revd William Reid (1814-96) emphasising duty to become active in the movement, now free from taint of subversiveness, "for thy brother's sake". Vast quantities of tracts on "Bible Temperance" were also necessary to quell erudite evangelical criticism of the fad. Only the Free Church was enthusiastic about following up

<sup>14</sup> Mechie, *The Church and Scottish Social Development*, 93. A. Drummond and J. Bulloch *The Scottish Churches 1688-1843* (Edinburgh, 1973), 27 simplifies this "second stage" greatly. See T. Guthrie, *Autobiography of T. Guthrie and Memoir By His Sons*, 2 vols. (London, 1874), and on Arnot, W. Arnot *Autobiography of the Revd William Arnot* (London, 1877), 250-58.

successful passage of Sunday Closing for Scotland with further temperance legislation, struck with Dr Buchanan's warning that, "a mere handful frequent the House of God, but they have other houses of worship in abundance . . . places for the sale of intoxicating drink, spirit shops, cellars, low taverns, flaring gin palaces and gaudy music saloons, doing the Devil's work as busily as they can" (Buchanan to the Free Church General Assembly, quoted from *First Annual Report Glasgow United Total Abstinence Society*, 1852.) The Church of Scotland and the United Presbyterians showed little interest in legislation, even although the latter's abstaining ministers increased significantly over 1845-1862.<sup>15</sup>

Sabbatarianism, however, was an avenue to conversion to temperance for clerics after the 1860s. Temperance became identified with the work of three Sabbatarian societies — the Edinburgh-based Lord's Day Observance Association of Scotland, the Scottish Society for the Promotion of the Due Observance of the Lord's Day, and the Glasgow Workingmen's Sabbath Protection Society (1849). In spite of the way teetotal counter-attractionists, that is, promoters of rational recreation, often clashed with Sabbatarians on how best to defend the Scottish Sabbath, Sabbatarians came to see the Sunday Closing movement as a means of keeping the Sunday question alive long after sensitivity to the issue of Sunday trains, for example, had evaporated. Publicisation of arrests for Sunday drunkenness was a feature of the teetotal press. Sabbatarianism was also central to the P.S.A.s, or Pleasant Sunday Afternoon Clubs, for workingmen. The leading teetotal thrift organisation, The Independent Order of Rechabites (1835), also continued Sabbath protection work, noting recalcitrant Sunday traders in addition to drinkers. Turn-of-the-

<sup>15</sup> Examples of this tract warfare include Aristides (pseud.) *A Reply to the Revd J. Gibson's "Principle of Bible Temperance"* (Glasgow, 1855); Brown, *Nehushtan, or the Principles of Hezekiah applied to the Temperance Reformation* (Glasgow, n.d.); J. B. Burnett, *Christian Self-Denial Its Application to Abstinence* (Montrose, 1845); A. Dewar, *An Urgent Appeal to Ministers of Christ of All Denominations on their Apathy to the Temperance Reformation* (London, 1856); J. Gibson, *Principles of Bible Temperance* (Glasgow, 1854); W. Reid, *The Church in a False Position Regarding Temperance* (Edinburgh, 1846).

century criticism of Sabbath breaking in teetotal literature even ventured into the vexed area of Sunday football!<sup>16</sup>

After the passage of Sunday Closing, the United Presbyterians became more closely associated with the movement than any other denomination. In Glasgow alone, the Revds Calderwood, Dr Jeffrey, Logan Aikman, Niven, Kerr, Borland, Macrae, Robertson, Johnston, McGill, Cowan, Knox and Blythe all espoused it. This did not, however, denote extremism. The Evangelical Union was alone in collective support for total abstinence, ostracism of "the Trade", and use of non-alcoholic communion wine — the stance demanded by reformers. It was to be expected, therefore, that by the late 1850s Evangelical Unionists such as the Revd Fergus Ferguson became powerful in the Scottish Temperance League. In contrast, Scottish Congregationalists were dominated by cautious, conservative churchmen like Wardlaw. Forty-nine Congregationalist ministers had joined the League by the late 1850s but a denominational society was formed only in 1867.<sup>17</sup> Church of Scotland ministers, too, had now lost their lead in temperance. Few now became noted reformers. The example of

<sup>16</sup> Office-bearers of the Glasgow Workingmen's Sabbath Protection Society included the temperance reformers Kidston, Collins, Kinnaird, McGavin, Hamilton, Salmon, Bailie Torrens and Councillor Colquhoun, its patron being Shaftesbury: G.W.M.S.P.S., *Annual Report* (1879-80). "Violation of the Sabbath", *Rechabite and Temperance Magazine* (June 1911) suggested 20% of Sunday traders were "foreigners". Sabbatarianism's appeal is contrasted with that of temperance in Drummond and Bulloch, *Scottish Churches*, 21-25. On the trains issue, see E. Robertson, "Early Scottish Railways and Observance of the Sabbath", *Scottish Historical Review*, lvii (1978), 151. Reformers often quoted the Edinburgh Police Superintendent's description of the immigrant's Sabbath from *P.P.*, 1846 (530) 13 Minutes of Evidence. Parliamentary returns on arrests for Sunday drunkenness were also cited in *STLR* (1892), 19. Sunday "pub-watching" and claims that two million were "desecrating the Sabbath" were a feature of the 1850s onwards: see Glasgow United Total Abstinence Society, *Third Annual Report* (1854), and the Scottish Temperance League, *Adviser* (1850), 23, while *Glasgow Argus* (Sat. 29 Aug. 1857) describes in contrast the exhausting evangelical Sunday. Parallel trends in England are the subject of B. Harrison, "The Sunday Trading Riots of 1855", *Historical Journal*, 8 (2) (1965), 219-45. Scottish support for universal Sunday Closing is detailed in the Scottish Permissive Bill and Temperance Association, *Annual Reports* (1877-78), 19; (1900-1901), 11. Scottish M.P.s such as Brigg, Burt, Henderson, Wilson, Harvey, Richards, and Sir George White were prominent in presentation of a 1911-1912 Sunday Closing Bill of this nature, according to the Glasgow Wine Spirit and Beer Trade, *Annual Report* (1912), 24.

<sup>17</sup> *Scottish Temperance Annual* (1899-1900); "The U.P. Church Total Abstinence Union"; 75-78; on Macrae (1837-1907) *STLR* (1908), 81-85, and *Rechabite and Temperance Magazine* (June 1987), "Notes". On Ker (?-1886), see A. Aird, "Temperance Movement", 302-06; on Hutton, *STLR* (1909), 71-74; on Wallace, A. Aird, "Temperance Movement", 363-68. On the Evangelical Union, see F. Ferguson, *A History of the Evangelical Union* (Glasgow, 1876); H. Kirk, *Memoirs of John Kirk, D.D.* (Edinburgh, 1888), and *STLR* (1857), "List of Abstaining Ministers", 59-62. A. Cossar, "The Temperance Movement in the C.U. of Scotland", *Scottish Temperance Annual* (1905-1906), 59-63 details the Congregationalist stance.

Brewster was not emulated. Only 34 were connected with the League, the most moderate and respectable of national societies, by 1860. Their support for it declined in the 1870s, peaking in the early 1890s before fading again. This greatly disappointed reformers, especially as Church of Scotland communicants in 1901, just after the rousing Peel Commission debates on licensing, numbered over 660,000. Free Church ministers outnumbered abstaining Established Church colleagues three to one in the early twentieth century. 66% of Free Church ministers were reckoned to be abstainers by the "Liberal Landslide" of 1906 which seemed to bring reformers closer to success than ever before.<sup>18</sup>

Why were so many such late converts to temperance, now a mass movement and a powerful political pressure group? Competing reform interests should be remembered. Many had for example made anti-slavery their priority for international reform and came to temperance belatedly under the influence of the numerous temperance reformers also active in anti-slavery, such as the Revd George Gladstone (1843-1910) of the Congregational Union, who fought for racial equality within Good Templary. Yet above all many were sympathetic to temperance in its "moderation", or anti-spirits, phase, but were hostile to the switch to insistence on total abstinence, and the commencement of prohibitionist politics. Infiltration of the Liberal Party and ostracism of "the Trade" were thought unwise and uncharitable. For clergy in many areas political loyalties were very complex after 1885. On social reform questions they often had Liberal sympathies, but on Ireland many were Unionists, much in the way that working-class drink traders were torn between Irish nationalism, teetotal threats, and Conservative promises of protection against prohibitionism.

In addition, ministers, like doctors, had much to lose by identification with the movement. Whilst ministers with a drink problem usually had great sympathy from colleagues and congregations, especially as expulsion from the Church or even suspension from a charge carried such disgrace, teetotallers in affluent areas were under pressure to shelve personal preferences in representation of the congregation's views, the latter being often that temperance should be the tool of the city mission, no more than that. There were clearly limits to the extent to which a rabid teetotaller could press total abstinence upon an unwilling congregation. Even ministers who were abstainers sometimes had grave reservations about the negative popular image of the temperance reformer, derived from Dickensian caricature and the vulgar and mercenary tactics of some temperance speakers and

<sup>18</sup> C. Cook and J. Stevenson, *British Historical Facts 1760-1830* (London, 1980), 224.

agents. Some seem to have distanced themselves from the movement after licensing restriction agitation began in earnest, as the Revd William Arnot (1807-1875) of the Free Church seemed to do. The competitiveness of this profession, resulting from its very popularity with the middle classes and the “aristocracy of labour”, encouraged compromise, notable in urban areas where the parochial system’s erosion made congregational approval paramount. Peer group pressure to abstain was not as yet consistent. In the 1870s for example alcoholic drinks continued to be sold in the refreshment rooms at Free and Established Church General Assemblies. Prohibitionists and moral suasionists alike continued to lament the relatively small numbers of teetotal ministers.<sup>19</sup>

What, then, was responsible for the popularity of temperance with the ministry from the 1880s onwards? The answer seems to be firstly that determined propaganda work among the students of the theological and normal colleges, funded by the Collins family, and featuring adroit use of lectures and conversaziones, was beginning to bear fruit, and secondly that the rise of a distinct “gospel-temperance” wing within the movement could not be ignored by the ministry.

Gospel-temperance, like the first temperance societies, was an American export, influenced by the example of female reformers during what was known as “The Ohio Whisky War”. Never before had reformers dared to attempt to close public houses by street and public-house prayer meetings. The Americans had bound reform and religion together in a distinctive creed extremely popular with the working classes. The result was a dynamic organisation, the Blue Ribbon Association. Led by Francis Murphy, a former convict converted to temperance and protestantism, it also emphasised the power of prayer in rehabilitating drunkards. Intensive camp meetings, or missions, of several weeks’ duration, and personal conversion drives aimed at drinkers and “the Trade”, were its hallmarks. This was an advance on earlier prohibitionist organisations like Good Templary which shunned all connection with the demon drink, preventing even members of the co-operative movement from joining if their retail outlets continued to sell alcohol. The Blue Ribboners were also advanced prohibitionists, using Paul’s Epistle to the Corinthians to assert not only that drunkenness impaired moral sense, hampering the work of evangelisation, but also that drunkards were damned and could not enter the Kingdom of God.<sup>20</sup>

<sup>19</sup> Paton, “Drink and the Temperance Movement”, 345-52; W. Arnot, *Autobiography of the Revd W. Arnot* (London, 1877).

<sup>20</sup> L. Lewis Shiman, “The Blue Ribbon Army: Gospel Temperance in England”, *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, 50 (4) (1981), 391-408, K. Heasman, *Evangelicals in Action*, 126-147, and the *STLR* Almanac Section which dated the movement from 19.1.1872.

Beginning in London's Hoxton Hall, a converted music hall, the Blue Ribbon spread like wildfire, aided by wealthy philanthropists like the Quaker biscuit manufacturer Palmer of Reading. Temperance fever over 1880-85 became intense in the West of Scotland where the ground had already been prepared by the visits of the Americans Mother Stewart of Ohio and Moody the singing evangelist.<sup>21</sup> Already, in 1874, a Glasgow Ladies' Prayer Union had sported white ribbons in solidarity with Murphy's devotees.<sup>22</sup> The Blue Ribbon missions were to be popular with the working classes and more affluent audiences. The Countess of Carlisle, who was to temperance what the Countess of Huntingdon had been to early Methodism, was converted to temperance by such a mission. The national temperance societies encouraged them, and English Dissenters were very enthusiastic in support. So too were Scottish Baptists. Individual laymen like Spite, the health reformer and provost of Clydebank, and the Rose and Lockhart families of Edinburgh had long followed McCree's example in temperance but a Scottish Baptist Total Abstinence Society (1881) was a product of the Blue Ribbon era. Tardiness in organisation may also in part have resulted from the high degree of autonomy in internal affairs which Baptist congregations enjoyed. Certainly, prior to gospel-temperance, there were 50 abstaining Baptist ministers. By 1901, few were not abstainers. This was significant, for between 1882-1901 Baptist membership increased while Church of Scotland and United Presbyterian expansion slowed, and the Free Church began to lose members. Also in the past doctrinal definition had marked the Baptists out from the Congregationalists, and the latter had been far more identified with Christian humanitarianism.<sup>23</sup>

In Glasgow alone, 20,000 signed the pledge during Murphy's visit. 1,000,000 sported the Blue Ribbon by 1882. Much success was due to skilful stage-management, for example, efficient advance-publicity, hire of capacious halls rather than inhibiting church halls, of choirs to increase the speaker's emotional impact, and of well-known supporting speakers. Permanent missions were established after charismatic speakers had passed on to pastures

<sup>21</sup> L. Lewis Shiman, "Blue Ribbon Army", 397. On Palmer see S. Yeo *Religion and Voluntary Associations in Crisis* (London, 1976).

<sup>22</sup> K. Heasman, *Evangelicals in Action*, 131.

<sup>23</sup> On the Quaker contribution, see E. Isichei, *Victorian Quakers* (London, 1970), 240; on the Wesleyans, M. Edwards, "The Teetotal Wesleyan Methodists", *Proceedings of the Wesley Historical Society*, 33 (1961-2), 63-70, E. Unwin, *Methodism and Sobriety* (London, n.d.), and Bebbington, *Nonconformist Conscience*, 3-8. *Scottish Temperance Annual* (1901-2), 64-67 carried an article on "The Scottish Baptist Total Abstinence Society". Spite's interests are discussed in my doctoral thesis (N. Logan), "Drink and Society: Scotland 1870-1914", chap. 3. Figures are from Cook and Stevenson, *British Historical Facts*, 230, table 24. Baptist work is mentioned briefly in A. Gilbert, *Religion and Society in Industrial England* (London, 1976), 43.

new. Yet there was much about gospel-temperance which must have made churchmen slightly uneasy. There was much that was dubious about gospel-temperance. The Blue Ribbon "army" created was not an organisational structure. Blue Ribboners were linked only by subscription to a *Blue Ribbon Gazette*. The movement gave pseudo-evangelists opportunity to commit notorious frauds, and star speakers grand lifestyles which irritated veteran working-class temperance reformers. Above all its theatricality nauseated aristocratic reformers like Shaftesbury, and its hold on the masses was ephemeral. It asked only that they don a ribbon, it meant no permanent accession of strength for temperance societies, nor perhaps for the Churches. After 12 years it faded. Its missions passed quickly from popular memory, as with the Paisley "Mission of Love" which bequeathed ample property and funds to the Scottish Band of Hope Union. Yet their influence could linger surprisingly long, as exemplified by the way in which the Paisley football club St Mirren, based at Love Street, continued to resist both professionalisation and any connection with the drink trade until the late 1920s.<sup>24</sup>

One fairly immediate outcome of gospel-temperance was commitment of the Churches to the temperance movement. Temperance was now a spiritual rather than a moral question. Strong support for licensing restriction became noticeable at Free Church Councils and Established Church General Assemblies. Previously the clergy tended towards sympathy for measures pertaining to a more humane treatment of drunkards but, like the celebrated Bishop Magee, were not convinced of the need for legislation for the population as a whole, thinking state intervention a greater evil. Liberal licensing initiatives, plus gospel-temperance, now encouraged younger men to identify with prohibitionism. By the turn of the century, the Baptist Union voted to abolish grocers' licences, and there was considerable Free and Established Church support for the Children's Bills of 1900 and 1901, on the sale of drink to children, and uniform British Sunday Closing on the Scottish model, in Scotland and in England.<sup>25</sup>

Temperance reformers, however, were disappointed by the Churches' failure to differentiate between temperance and licensed-trade solutions to the drink problem. They were dismayed by the

<sup>24</sup> A. Kimball, *The Blue Ribbon* (New York, 1894): Robert Simpson the Glasgow merchant invited Murphy to Glasgow. The "Mission of Love" left funds in trust for the Paisley Band of Hope to continue work in the birthplace of juvenile temperance. I am indebted to the Secretary of the Band of Hope Union for this information.

<sup>25</sup> Bebbington, *Nonconformist Conscience*, 47-49; Lewis Shiman, "The Church of England Temperance Society of the 19th Century", *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, 41 (2) (1972); and on the Peel Commission, D. Fahey, "Temperance and the Liberal Party: Lord Peel's Report of 1899", *Journal of British Studies* (10) (1971).

ministry's indiscriminate support for the drink trade's public-house management schemes, notably after the formation of a Public-House Reform Association in 1894, and for the Gothenburg retail-control system in particular — a scheme which gave the people a vested interest in perpetuation rather than eradication of the drink trade. Prohibitionist propaganda had not hit home.

Yet while the Churches were not militant in their temperance, and did not initiate temperance legislation, they were increasingly active in support of society agitation against certain bills, for example, the County Councils Bill of 1888 which threatened to taint education with "drink money", a licensing scheme in 1890, and the compensation clauses of the Licensing Act of 1904. After 1893, all of the Churches backed the national temperance societies in their campaign to restrict and to veto licenses, with the exception of the Roman Catholic Church. Scottish churchmen were in the vanguard of this movement, pushing the Scottish Churches towards teetotalism, and setting the pace for the moderate Anglican temperance society. The latter now pressed with the rest for a Royal Commission on Licensing. This did not, however, satisfy impatient reformers, ever emphatic of the urgency of their cause, especially as many churchmen disappointed them bitterly by supporting the Royal Commission's moderate Minority Report as a basis for reform. The Scottish Prohibition Party, led by Edwin Scrymgeour of Dundee (1866-1947), was particularly disgusted that ministers should side with cautious politicians and brewery-share-owning Anglicans and lambasted the perfidy of "the false Church".

In reality the Scottish Churches were contributing to Scotland's vaunted lead in temperance as much as they could. The total number of abstaining ministers had risen steadily from around 1,573 in 1891 to 1,861 in 1899. By 1903, 30% of Church of Scotland ministers, 68% of the Free Church's, 65% of United Presbyterians, 97% of the Congregational Union's ministers, all Baptist and Evangelical Union ministers, and the great majority of Original Secession, Reformed Presbyterian, Wesleyan and Primitive Methodist churchmen in Scotland were abstainers. Yet abstinence was not synonymous with society membership, nor support for legislation, and the Scottish Temperance League noticeably ceased to attempt to calculate the numbers of abstaining churchmen after 1906. Certainly, the great majority of clerics associated with the League by 1900 were United Presbyterians or Free Church. Between 1901-1915 the number of United Free ministers associated with the League rose from 431-479. The noisy clerical pressure group for prohibition, however, gives a false impression of Free Church attitudes. Individual Free Kirkers were extremely militant prohibitionists; one thinks of the Revds William Lindsay of Edinburgh, John McCracken of Glasgow, and F.

Wilson Stuart of Gartly, not to mention the Revd James Barr, but the Revd Principal Rainy and Revd James Paton committed their Church to a far more moderate stance, that is, pressure for legislation "on the lines and in the spirit of the Minority Report of the Royal Commission on Licensing". Energy was directed into temperance sermons rather than pressure group politics. Also, although the Free Church tended in the twentieth century to be quicker and more emphatic in denunciation of the drink problem than the Church of Scotland, many clearly paid lip-service to temperance as it became highly fashionable. Meaningful assault upon the drink trade, consistent with prohibitionist sentiment, was undermined by willingness to accept significantly large donations from a family whose fortune stemmed from the Australian taste for beer — the classic reform dilemma depicted by Shaw in *Major Barbara*.<sup>26</sup>

How then did temperance affect the average Scottish congregation in the late nineteenth century? The advance of temperance sentiment was reflected in steady growth of the numbers of churches using non-alcoholic communion wine. 70 Free Churches had used this in 1887, but 734 were using it by 1914. This "wine question" was a spin-off of the theological facet of evangelicalism, and escalation of teetotal propaganda against Christian expediency arguments. By the 1880s, reformers had studied the Bible exhaustively. Their assertions that it referred only to unfermented grape-juice, even in the Cana miracle, was taken as orthodox thought by teetotallers. Added to this were notions of bodily purity and health reform taken from literal interpretation of the phrase, "the Kingdom of God is within". This dovetailed perfectly with moral suasionist emphasis of eternal vigilance, and the need to internalise evangelical virtues, rather than making men sober by Act of Parliament, for lasting amelioration of the plight of the working classes. Nor surprisingly the architects of moral suasion were ministers like Gladstone and Fergus Ferguson.

Congregational pressure for introduction of non-alcoholic wine reflected the growing number of life abstainers in the population who, having been exposed to teetotal tales of virtually instant dipsomania and disaster following the use of alcohol, were genuinely fearful of communion wine and its effects, not least upon reformed drunkards! The number of teetotal church officials had also increased. In many areas, this question was simply an aspect of their status politics. Finally, fundamentalists who often felt themselves to be too unworthy to partake of communion wine were extremely sensitive to the idea of communion's abuse by desperate

<sup>26</sup> Scottish Permissive Bill and Temperance Association, *Annual Report* (1913), 38-39; *STLR* (1902), 99; D. Dow, "Domestic Response and Reaction to the Foreign Missionary Enterprise of the Principal Scottish Churches 1783-1929" (Edinburgh Ph.D. thesis, 1977).

alcoholics, or perhaps worse by drink-trade propagandists. In short, there were many who thought non-alcoholic wine to have been scientifically proven to be best for evangelisation and maintenance of church attendance rates, falling dismally for some churches over 1876-1891.

This question, raised in all three Presbyterian denominations, caused much ill-feeling and threats of secession until the Church of Scotland set a useful precedent by entrusting choice in the matter to individual ministers in two test cases during late 1870s. Few Free Church congregations succeeded over this but several United Presbyterian ones, prevented from adopting non-alcoholic wine, did. The question was also emotive for the Congregational Union, which joined with the Evangelical Union in 1897. There has been suggestion that in some areas where teetotal passions ran high at times, such as Leith, the "wine question" could provide the excuse for formation of a congregation composed of disgruntled breakaway elements, with more loyalty to teetotalism than traditional patterns of church government. By 1914, no less than 185 churches in Glasgow alone had made the switch, among them many suburban congregations later to be found wielding licensing restriction to make the city's South side "dry".<sup>27</sup> The social impact of this aspect of the "drink question" was doubtless to accentuate certain social divisions, notably those of temperance versus "The Trade" and of the respectable as against the non-respectable. One example of the latter tendency suffices here. Given that Scottish public-houses were already regarded as not fit places for ladies, by dint of their squalor, their tendency to be raided by what radicals dubbed "the police spy system" in the early nineteenth century, and the brutal aspects of the "perpendicular drinking" of working men, the "wine question" ensured that even in the home the drinking of alcohol came to be seen as a somewhat shocking and predominantly male pastime. Furthermore, success in this area facilitated assaults upon the drink trade ostensibly to protect women from contact with drink. By 1914, licensed grocers were under attack, on the grounds that they encouraged middle-class women to buy drink, and many women had been driven from the licensed trade, on the premise that they seduced the working-class male drinker. With the disappearance of barmaids from several teetotal strongholds, such as Paisley, attitudes had been formed towards women and drink which marked Scotland out from England — and which would not be challenged until the 1940s and the supermarket retail-revolution of the 1960s.

By 1914, therefore, Scottish churchmen had very largely adopted the language and assumptions of temperance. They were

<sup>27</sup> R. Howie, *The Churches and the Churchless in Scotland: Facts and Figures* (Glasgow, 1893), 118; *STLR* (1915), 47-56.

active in promotion of school "temperance lessons", the forerunner of "Anatomy, Physiology and Health", and the work of the Licensing Courts, where once their principal function had been merely to supply character-references for applicants. Inevitably, great denominational diversity continued. The United Free Church, representing nearly 500,000 Scots in 1900, was still the most outspoken on the question, and with the largest and most influential denominational temperance society. The Church of Scotland's society remained on a moderate, dual basis, abstainers and non-abstainers together, like the Anglicans and the Episcopalians. The Free Church stance resembled that of moderate prohibition, the Church of Scotland's that of moral suasion. The latter's reservations about denial of compensation to drink traders for loss of licence in particular sent prohibitionists into paroxysms of rage. Only belatedly did its Intemperance Committee's views coincide perfectly with the Free Church's, and then on "soft" issues, such as legislation on habitual drunkards and the sale of drink to children. Criticism of thorny questions, such as drinking-club anomalies suggestive of one law for the rich and another for the workingmen's club, stemmed usually from the Free Church alone. The Congregational Union was also in its way more dynamic on temperance, backing the Scottish Permissive Bill and Temperance Association and the Good Templars to the hilt. Its Temperance Committee was dominated by the prohibitionist Milne of Woodside, carrying forward the Evangelical Union tradition of enthusiastic reform personified by Kirk, Ferguson and Guthrie.<sup>28</sup>

Belated conversion to temperance was directly related to revivalism, gospel-temperance, the "wine question", but also to the challenges of secularisation, scepticism, socialism, and sectarianism. Declining church-attendance figures had come as a

<sup>28</sup> See e.g. letter of 24.5.1855 from Revd D. W. Gordon, Earlston, to G. Baillie of Jerviswoode "respecting the Black Bull at Earlston", fo. 2 (34), held by the Regional Librarian, and "Minutes of Evidence", Oban Town Council Papers, 5.1.1847. J. Hunter, "Jubilee of the Free Church Temperance Society", *Scottish Temperance Annual* (1899), 70-73. *Rechabite and Temperance Magazine* (Jan. 1903), 52, "Important Resolution by Glasgow U.F. Presbytery" commented on Dr Raith's pressure for abstinence to be urged upon all new communicants. On the Established Church, see J. Paton, "The Temperance Movement in the Church of Scotland 1849-1899", *Scottish Temperance Annual* (1900), 71-75. Its total membership rose as follows: 1894: 32,000; 1895: 38,960; 1896: 49,157; 1897: 56,360; 1898: 63,164; 1899: 65,808. According to the *Rechabite and Temperance Magazine* (April, 1987), "Comments", it was still acceptable for Dr Donald Macleod, a former Moderator of the Church of Scotland, to attend Edinburgh Licensed Trade Dinners. Foreign observers did not realise that the C. of S. society was still on the dual basis and incorrectly counted it with total abstinence societies: see International Temperance Conference, *Centennial Temperance Volume: A Memorial of the International Temperance Conference* (Philadelphia, 1876). M. McGregor, *Towards Scotland's Social Good*, 94-103; A. Cossar, "Temperance Movement", 59-63, and "An Appeal to the Ministers of Scotland", *STLR* (1908), 78-80.

shock given church-building work, Disruption moral fervour, and the work of the Sunday Schools. This theme was constantly stressed by temperance reformers in the 1850s, and it had new relevance for certain churches by the end of the nineteenth century. Temperance, and the network of leisure organisations which it spawned, was portrayed as a social bridge between the Churches and the "unchurched" urban masses, hence clerical interest in esoteric and somewhat élitist organisations such as Good Templary. Support for temperance in this sense was emblematic of loss of secular authority and prestige. The march of science which propelled medical men into the temperance movement also undermined Scripture and made fundamentalism untenable. Many ministers could continue to synthesise science and religion in temperance literature when the era when they could do so for a general audience, as McCosh did, had passed.

Temperance was also a means of maintaining contact with working-class politics, in this period moving from traditional Liberal/Radical loyalties towards socialism and the Left. "Temperance was a source of conviction among Scottish labour leaders and deeply embedded in their social consciousness, even among those who were members of the more Marxist-orientated organisations".<sup>29</sup> Temperance was a respectable form of expression for some very radical ministers, notably Barr, thus tending paradoxically to encourage attacks on public-house landlords to become more general critiques of landlordism while at the same time masking for many the shift to the Left and increased class tension. Scrymgeour's political victories in Dundee for example were as much attributable to his militant prohibitionism and Gilfillan Church radicalism as to E. D. Morell and local socialist traditions.

The larger denominations were also reacting to the challenge of Dissent, and in particular of the Salvationists, Universalists, and Churches of Christ, when emphasising their support for temperance and other social reform crusades. Such rivals appeared to benefit from the declining membership of the Presbyterian Churches. The Churches of Christ for example expanded from 39 in 1900 to 55 by 1915. There were six in Glasgow alone. Not a little of the hostility sometimes evoked by the Scottish Permissive Bill and Temperance Association derived from association with the prominent Mormon,

<sup>29</sup> W. Knox, *Scottish Labour Leader 1918-1939* (Edinburgh, 1984), 22-26.

Elliott Tickle. Presbyterians were also to a greater or lesser extent conscious of a Roman Catholic Challenge.<sup>30</sup>

Catholic Church attendance levels were good over the years 1851-1881 and, although the Catholic Church shared in the general decline of the 1880s, Catholic Churches in Scotland increased by 23% from 1881-1901. The Catholic population, moreover, increased by 35% for the same period, approaching the number of Established Church communicants for the year 1871.<sup>31</sup> Here too was a Church which responded positively to "temperance". Catholic temperance did not entirely disappear after Father Mathew's visit and the pledge campaigns in the 1840s. It re-emerged at national level most noticeably in the League of the Cross, recognised by the Pope in 1874. Its organiser was Father Nugent of Liverpool, a cleric influenced by Mathew, a visit to the teetotal Irish of Indiana, hostility to the boxing saloons and low public-houses of dockland, and, like Murphy, his experiences with convicts. The League's blend of self-help and evangelism paralleled that of protestant organisations. Hallmarks included Monday evening "Preseverance Reunions" for reformed drinkers, educational, emigration, and club work for all the family, and the establishment of Catholic newspapers, such as *The Catholic Times* and *The Catholic Fireside*. Members of the League wore sashes to church and to temperance rallies in a way reminiscent of Good Templary, even although they refused to march alongside this "secret organisation" at major rallies. As an organisation it faced similar problems of clerical hostility. It spread slowly through Britain, promoted by Manning, Archbishop of Westminster and a Cardinal after 1876, and in Scotland by Archbishop Eyre. The latter opened a Glasgow temperance hall in 1877 and made the League obligatory in every Glasgow parish. By 1891, the League of the Cross had even reached Barra's two Catholic churches. .The

<sup>30</sup> J. Muirhead, "The Revival as a Dimension of Scottish Church History", *ante*, x (1980), 179-96. Glasgow United Total Abstainers' Association Reports (1853-54) mention that Ferguson, the Gorbals missionary, complained of no Bibles but "plenty of bottles", and that the Association had extensively surveyed the city to assess religiosity. In similar vein see *Glasgow 1858: The Shadow's Midnight Scenes and Social Photographs*, ed. J. McCaffrey (Glasgow, 1979), 42-51. Cook and Stevenson, *British Historical Facts*, table 4, 221 is relevant here as is H. McLeod's essay "Religion in the City", *Urban History Yearbook* (1978), 5-21. I am indebted to Dr R. Miller for permission to read his manuscript, "The Scottish Mission", on the Universalists, J. Ure Mitchell and Caroline Soule, active in Glasgow at this point.

<sup>31</sup> Cook and Stevenson, *British Historical Facts*, table 10, 223; 11, 224.

"wine question" was paralleled by Catholic debate upon the frequency of communion.<sup>32</sup>

To the Catholic clergy, temperance was inextricably bound up with the restoration of the Scottish hierarchy at the beginning of this period. Temperance was self-help and a distancing of members from the more suspect aspects of Irish nationalism, the latter being very much linked with public-house culture and the organisations, such as football clubs, spawned by it. Like education, temperance was regarded as the key to creation of middle-class leadership, hitherto absent, and a brake upon radicalism and conversion to protestantism. It was part of Eyre's "consolidation, stabilisation, and Romanisation", and complemented waves of church-building financed by wealthy benefactors like Maxwell, Monteith, and Gordon.<sup>33</sup> The zeal of wealthy converts accentuated shifts from theological or liturgical issues towards social reform. A devotional revolution was in short accompanied by a "cult of respectability". The extent to which temperance, at the heart of the latter, was also in part a defensive reaction to the anti-papery crusades of the early

<sup>32</sup> G. Hayler, *Famous Fanatics* (London, 1911), 48-54; N. Longmate, *The Waterdrinkers* (London, 1968), 110-118; Canon Bennet, *Father Nugent of Liverpool* (Liverpool, 1949), 104-142; *Rechabite and Temperance Magazine* (Sept. 1905), "Death of Msgr. Nugent"; A. Dingle and B. Harrison, "Cardinal Manning as a Temperance Reformer", *Historical Journal*, 12 (3) (1969), 487-88; S. Dark, *Cardinal Manning* (London, 1936), 65-103; L. Strachey, *Five Victorians* (London, 1942), 345-434. Scottish references are from *Tablet*, 14.1.1871, E. Morris *The History of the Temperance and Teetotal Societies in Glasgow from their Origin to the Present* (Glasgow 1855), 92-93, and 162-63; P. Winskill, *Temperance Standard Bearers of the 19th Century* (Manchester, 1897), i, 359, on McEnraght who continued Mathew's work. *STLR* (1898), 60, and (1877), 59, detail the League of the Cross' formation. St Patrick's Temperance Hall appears in Eyre's diary MS. of 10.9.1877, while the injunction mentioned was in "To the faithful of the Archdiocese . . . Glasgow, 13.5.1889, from the Archbishop of Glasgow". Scottish Temperance League and Scottish Permissive Bill and Temperance Association publications did not often refer to Catholic temperance. Barra is mentioned in "Novel Scene", *Rechabite and Temperance Magazine* 1891. The local press is more helpful on Catholic temperance meetings, — e.g. *Hamilton Advertiser*, 2.2.1889, notes formation of St Mary's League of the Cross.

<sup>33</sup> B. Aspinwall, "Second Spring and formation of the Catholic Community in the West of Scotland", *Clergy Review*, 65 (1981). On racial tension amongst the clergy, see J. Walsh, "Archbishop Manning's Visitation of the Western District of Scotland in 1867", *Innes Review*, 18 (1967), 3-18. For the notion of "respectability", W. Walker, *Juteopolis: Dundee and its Textile Workers 1885-1923* (Edinburgh, 1979), 55-56 is interesting here. Wealthy converts are discussed in B. Aspinwall, "David Urquhart, Robert Monteith, and the Catholic Church: A Search for Justice and Peace", *Innes Review*, 13 (1980), 71-87. On cultural trends, see J. McCaffrey, "Roman Catholics in Scotland in the 19th and 20th Centuries", *ante*, xxi (1983); O. D. Edwards, "The Catholic Press in Scotland since the Restoration of the Hierarchy", *Innes Review*, 29 (1978), 156-183, and on politics specifically J. McCaffrey, "Politics and the Catholic Community Since 1878", *Innes Review*, 29 (1978); and W. Walker, "Irish Immigrants in Scotland", *Historical Journal*, 15 (1972), 649-67 are very relevant here. Quoted here is J. Cooney, *Scotland and the Papacy* (Edinburgh, 1982), 17.

nineteenth century is not without irony. The temperance reformers Hope, McGavin, Turnbull, Begg and the teetotal "Edinburgh Mission to Catholics" were as much part of that crusade as were the demagogues John Sayers Orr and Hughie Long of Glasgow. The Vatican Council of 1869 ruling on Papal Authority, together with the Irish Question, meant that in this period there was little co-operation with the protestant Churches in temperance reform. Only Father Hays, noted for his work in juvenile temperance, was to be found on the platforms of the national temperance societies.<sup>34</sup>

By 1914, therefore, the Scottish Churches were formally identified with the temperance movement, to a great or lesser extent. Churchmen had come to recognise the drink question as the great social problem it undoubtedly was given poor diet and urban overcrowding. Yet, as indicated, identification was not synonymous with unreserved support for temperance as a political pressure group, nor unqualified support for radical temperance solutions. The degree to which individual Churches supported the movement tends to confound preconceived notions about the extent of radicalism within the Established and Noncomformist Churches. Church of Scotland ministers were not necessarily far behind colleagues in other churches on this question, and Catholic temperance should not be forgotten. While it would be true to say that paying lip-service to the teetotal fad was fairly general, opinion on the question in the Scottish Churches was nevertheless more "advanced", or positive, than in any other of Britain.

This consensus of support contributed to some extent to Presbyterian church "unity" and to a polarisation of the evangelical and ultramontane standpoints. Churchmen converted to temperance were influenced by the rural-urban dichotomy, yet the "prophetic awakening" of social criticism delineated by D. C. Smith was also related to important social shifts after 1840. Those attracted to temperance were often the lower middle-class and working-class men attracted to the ministry after the Disruption. Frequently found in home and overseas mission work, they sought in the "drink question" and its native-races sub-theme a way to recapture the excitement and moral certainties of the Disruption and subsequent revivals. Many had themselves known remarkable social and geographic mobility through self-education and self-help and advocated temperance without hint of hypocrisy or condescension, little realising that Smilesean recipes for social mobility were increasingly unpalatable given the poverty and unemployment of the "Great Depression" era, and increasingly

<sup>34</sup> The only reference to co-operation in temperance that the author found was on St Andrew's Catholic Temperance Society's participation at an Amalgamated Temperance Council demonstration of 1909: see Scottish Permissive Bill and Temperance Association, *Annual Report* (1909-10), 22.

restricted opportunities for upward movement. The greatest allies of temperance had been the middle-class evangelicals described by A. A. McLaren. Late nineteenth-century shifts away from static social class categories, notably in the region of the "labour aristocracy" and the bourgeoisie, were however adversely to affect religion and reform. This was accentuated by the way urban areas were receptive not only to religious radicalism but also to political radicalism.<sup>35</sup> Even as temperance reformers of the calibre of Blaikie, Swanson and Barr worked to continue the social Christianity of Guthrie and Begg, using temperance to find new pastoral perspectives, rivalry in reform made the clerical voice less authoritative, and merely one of many pressure groups seeking with increasing difficulty after 1906 to impose its view of "popular will" upon the Liberal Party. Just as prohibitionist propaganda did much to disillusion reformers with the existing party system, it also had a pernicious effect on the Churches, identifying them with conservatism, old-fashioned attitudes to reform, and worst of all self-interest. Conversely, belated formation of a Temperance Council of Christian Churches (1915), in which even the Salvationists co-operated, was a pyrrhic victory for temperance which also did nothing to create a positive image in the popular mind. The teetotal connection now only accentuated working-class indifference and hostility to organised religion, linking the latter with wartime drink control, not to mention odious attempts at "social control". With a few regional exceptions, this was very true of the inter-war years, when grave social and economic problems killed off facile moral interpretations of poverty and challenged voluntaryism, rendering the temperance fad passé, and utterly irrelevant.

<sup>35</sup> S. Mews, "Urban Problems and Rural Solutions — Drink and Disestablishment in the First World War", *Studies in Church History*, 26, ed. D. Baker (Oxford 1981); D. Smith, "The Failure and Recovery of Social Criticism in the Scottish Churches 1830-1950" (Edinburgh Ph.D., 1964), 54-83; A. McLaren, *Religion and Social Class: the Disruption Years in Aberdeen* (London, 1974). I am indebted to the Churches' Council on Alcoholism and Drugs, 4 Southampton Row, London, for information on its origins.

